

## **BACKGROUND MATERIAL on US higher-education reform dialogue 2006-2012**

**Meera Sitharam, University of Florida, November 2012**

Here's a bunch of background information I collected over time for "higher ed reform" and various related issues and responses.

### **PROBLEM 1: High higher ed cost**

=====

There is tons of stuff on this -- writing about it has become a career.

US dept of education: 2006 The problem of high cost for Higher ed  
<http://www2.ed.gov/about/bdscomm/list/hiedfuture/reports/pre-pub-report.pdf>  
<http://www2.ed.gov/about/bdscomm/list/hiedfuture/reports.html>

----  
2008 US dept of education report blaming tenure and faculty salaries and recommending department mergers  
<http://www2.ed.gov/about/bdscomm/list/hiedfuture/reports/dickeson2.pdf>

----  
Rebuttal: AAUP and other saying Faculty salaries are not the cause of increasing cost of highered  
<http://www.aaup.org/AAUP/comm/rep/Z/ecstatereport11-12/>  
[http://chronicle.com/article/article-content/135500/%20?utm\\_source=UFF-UF+Bargaining+Unit&utm\\_campaign=8c2531909a-13+November+2012+Newsletter&utm\\_medium=email](http://chronicle.com/article/article-content/135500/%20?utm_source=UFF-UF+Bargaining+Unit&utm_campaign=8c2531909a-13+November+2012+Newsletter&utm_medium=email)  
<http://chronicle.com/article/College-Costs-Too-Much-Because/133357/>  
[http://www.washingtonmonthly.com/magazine/septemberoctober\\_2011/features/administrators\\_ate\\_my\\_tuition031641.php?page=1](http://www.washingtonmonthly.com/magazine/septemberoctober_2011/features/administrators_ate_my_tuition031641.php?page=1)

### **PROBLEM 2: STEM shortage**

=====

Writing about this has become another career.

US govt: The problem of current and impending skills shortages in STEM  
[http://www.jec.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?a=Files.Serve&File\\_id=6aaa7e1f-9586-47be-82e7-326f47658320](http://www.jec.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?a=Files.Serve&File_id=6aaa7e1f-9586-47be-82e7-326f47658320)

Points out that the STEM pipeline breaks down at the elementary and middle school level - a consequence of inadequate teaching and mentorship, but also a cultural shift in occupational expectations. I would add: unrealistic expectations of occupational gratification in relation to amount of work, huge disparity in incomes between occupations that require the same level of capacity, training and responsibility (due to various barriers, distortions, and anti-competitive practices), and cultural stereotyping (see immigrant STEM labor issues below).

Points out also that partly the shortages are because STEM graduates are snatched up by many types of non-STEM employers because of general analytic skills. So these graduates have a wide choice of employers, and the core STEM industry is not able to compete with the highest bidding employers.

---

<http://tcf.org/blogs/botc?topic=education>

<http://economistsview.typepad.com/economistsview/2011/08/future-skill-shortages-in-the-us-economy.html>

---

Microsoft talking about the STEM problem

<http://www.microsoft.com/en-us/news/download/presskits/citizenship/MSNTS.pdf>

Caution: high-tech corporates have a vested interest in a STEM labor glut.

---

Rebuttal as to why high-quality, functional STEM ed requires critical thinking and other skills

<http://www.aacu.org/liberaleducation/le-wi12/humphreys.cfm>

## **US vs. Immigrant STEM LABOR**

Skilled labor shortages immediately bring in the question of skilled labor immigration.

<http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052970203897404578076484241899330.html>

[http://neu.hwwi.de/fileadmin/hwwi/Publikationen/Dossier/Demografie/Boswell\\_Stiller\\_Straubhaar\\_Forecasting\\_Labour\\_and\\_Skills\\_Shortages.pdf](http://neu.hwwi.de/fileadmin/hwwi/Publikationen/Dossier/Demografie/Boswell_Stiller_Straubhaar_Forecasting_Labour_and_Skills_Shortages.pdf)

<http://www.immigration.govt.nz/NR/rdonlyres/063ECB35-F5D5-44D8-8325-7041A727A9D5/0/INZ109330July2012.pdf>

----

Skilled labor shortage deniers (From the right, anti-immigrant sentiment; From the left, allegation that corporates want a skilled labor glut)

CAUTION: while foreign H1B visas are tied to employers, thus causing "indentured labor," the argument - that this causes depressed STEM industry wages for Americans - is bogus since the H1B quota every year is about 10% of the estimated STEM labor demand; in any case, the way to fix this is to decouple H1B's from employers and attach it to the employee solely (as long as they are employed)

[http://www.fairus.org/site/DocServer/H1B\\_2011\\_final.pdf](http://www.fairus.org/site/DocServer/H1B_2011_final.pdf)

---

More reasonable speculation is that companies are afraid to hire, are *unwilling to train for specialized skillsets*, have been slow to set up apprenticeship pipelines from universities, and demand too much from hires, all because they are worried about sinking back into recession

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/06/14/us-usa-economy-skills-idUSBRE85D1LC20120614>

<http://business.time.com/2012/06/04/the-skills-gap-myth-why-companies-cant-find-good-people/>

<http://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2012/06/hey-that-famous-skills-shortage-youve-heard-about-its-a-myth/258207/>

## **US GOVT. PUSH FOR DIPLOMAS (1-2 year degrees)**

Focus on postsecondary degrees (community colleges and diplomas) "transforming career and technical education" and US government positions

<http://www.ed.gov/news/press-releases/us-department-education-releases-blueprint-transform-career-and-technical-educat>

<http://www.publicconsultinggroup.com/educationlaw/post/The-Obama-Administration-Proposes-to-Transform-Career-and-Technical-Education.aspx>

## **STATES SOLUTIONS TO PROBLEM 1 and PROBLEM 2**

---

National Governor's association and other thinktank fixes for public highered - "complete college"

<http://www.nga.org/cms/home/nga-center-for-best-practices/center-publications/page-edu-publications/col2-content/main-content-list/from-information-to-action-revam.html>

<http://www.nga.org/cms/home/nga-center-for-best-practices/center-publications/page-edu-publications/col2-content/main-content-list/complete-to-compete-common-colle.html>

<http://www.slideshare.net/FLHigherEd/cca-performance-funding-think-this>

<http://www.slideshare.net/FLHigherEd/cca-metrics-technicalguide232012>

<http://www.slideshare.net/FLHigherEd/cca-essential-steps-common-measures-of-progress>

[http://www.completecollege.org/path\\_forward/essentialsteps/](http://www.completecollege.org/path_forward/essentialsteps/)

-----

Rebuttal as to why "completing college" says nothing about what they learnt and how to do better

<http://www.aacu.org/liberaleducation/le-wi12/humphreys.cfm>

----

State of Washington document on correlating degrees and workforce demand

<http://www.wsac.wa.gov/sites/default/files/SkilledEducatedWorkforce2011.pdf>

---

Rebuttal: Australian experience 2002-2012 as to why using 4yr degree price incentives to address workforce skills shortages is *doomed to fail*

<http://www.abc.net.au/unleashed/4053438.html>

## **FLORIDA (2012)**

---

Scott executive order for BRTF

<http://www.flgov.com/wp-content/uploads/orders/2012/12-104-blueribbon.pdf>

BRTF report

<http://www.slideshare.net/FLHigherEd/working-draft-brtf4dot1>

BOG strategic plan and accountability and economic impacts

<http://www.flbog.edu/pressroom/strategicplan.php/>

[http://www.flbog.edu/\\_doc/economic\\_impacts\\_of\\_the\\_sus\\_of\\_florida\\_fy\\_2009-10\\_gov.pdf](http://www.flbog.edu/_doc/economic_impacts_of_the_sus_of_florida_fy_2009-10_gov.pdf)

Responses:

<http://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2012/11/should-science-majors-pay-less-for-college-than-art-majors/264417/>

<http://chronicle.com/blogs/conversation/2012/11/01/more-stem-majors-wont-solve-higher-educations-problems/> <http://www.gainesville.com/section/news05>

[http://andrewsullivan.thedailybeast.com/2012/11/discounted-degrees-101.html?](http://andrewsullivan.thedailybeast.com/2012/11/discounted-degrees-101.html?utm_source=pulsenews&utm_medium=referral&utm_campaign=Feed%3A+andrewsullivan%2FrApM+%28The+Daily+Dish%29)

[utm\\_source=pulsenews&utm\\_medium=referral&utm\\_campaign=Feed%3A+andrewsullivan%2FrApM+%28The+Daily+Dish%29](http://andrewsullivan.thedailybeast.com/2012/11/discounted-degrees-101.html?utm_source=pulsenews&utm_medium=referral&utm_campaign=Feed%3A+andrewsullivan%2FrApM+%28The+Daily+Dish%29)

## **TEXAS (2010) and responses**

Original:

<http://texashighered.com/print/2>

Response:

<http://7solutionsresponse.org/>

Texas coalition for higher ed excellence and Alliance for TAMU

<http://texaseducationexcellence.org/>

<http://alliancefortamu.org/>

2012 Penn research report about Texas reform:

[http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=2&ved=0CCcQFjAB&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.insidehighered.com%2Fsites%2Fdefault%2Fserver\\_files%2Ffiles%2FSRP-TX-Report.pdf&ei=yIZTUPi8CI\\_m8QT004HYDg&usg=AFQjCNHFiYr0rFiTjafPZ8-xx7UmarWd9A&sig2=HtwmJia6\\_WhhsG30a1sX8g&cad=rja](http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=2&ved=0CCcQFjAB&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.insidehighered.com%2Fsites%2Fdefault%2Fserver_files%2Ffiles%2FSRP-TX-Report.pdf&ei=yIZTUPi8CI_m8QT004HYDg&usg=AFQjCNHFiYr0rFiTjafPZ8-xx7UmarWd9A&sig2=HtwmJia6_WhhsG30a1sX8g&cad=rja)

This article mentions the above 2012 report

<http://www.texastribune.org/texas-education/higher-education/new-report-questions-texas-higher-ed-priorities/>

This article mentions the above 2012 report and Washington State "Leadership vacuum on higher ed"

<http://seattletimes.com/text/2017199331.html>